SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV: That is true of Rajdhani Express.

SHRI MADHAVRAO SCINDIA: I am not prepared to consider it.

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV: Especially in Rajdhani Express, food is very well cooked.

Avoidance of mid-air collision between two Indian Airlines Boeings

*123. SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: †
SHRI YASHWANT SINHA:

Will the Minister of CIVIL AVIATION AND TOURISM be pleased to state:

(a) whether Government's attention has been drawn to the news item that a mid-air collision between two Indian Airlines Boeing 737s was averted, about 100 to 150 kilometres from Bombay on the 4th July, 1989; and

(b) if so, what action has been initiated by Government to avert such incidents?

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF CIVIL AVIATION AND TOURISM (SHRI SHIVRAJ PATIL): (a) Government is aware of an airmiss between the two Indian Airlines B-737 aircraft in the controlled air space of Bombay airport on the 4th July, 1989.

(b) Air Traffic Controller involved in the incident has been withdrawn from active Air Traffic Control duties. Air Traffic Control Rating of the Air Traffic Controller involved in the incident has been suspended.

A plan for modernisation of the air traffic control system, installation of secondary surveillance radar at Bombay airport has been initiated.

†The question was actually asked on the floor of the House by Shri Kamal Morarka.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Sir, it is a shockingly fallous and careless answer to my question. The Minister admits that two Boeings nearly clashed. Does this House take cognizance only after 150 passengers are dead? If two Boeings clashed in the mid-air, more than 300 passengers would have been dead. And what is the answer I am getting? 'The Government is aware of the near-miss', as if it is something routine. And then what have you done? You have suspended one Air Traffic Controller. Action has been initiated to upgrade the equipment. I do not understand. We have spent so much time on the Airlines' food. But I am really very much concerned, for this is the state of safety. I do not think anybody will be travelling by Indian Airlines. I can understand such a thing in America where there is crowded sky. But in India, where there are hardly flights few and far between, a near-miss is understandable. It is inconceivable with Delhi-Mangalore flights. Something is seriously wrong with your entire air traffic control, with the training. I want a clarification for the answer. Have you found out whether the inquiry was initiated? Was that Air Traffic Controller an experienced chap or was he a novice? What is the whole system? Just don't tell us. "We are aware of the miss and one chap has been suspended." How do we know that it will not happen today, it will not happen again and again? You please give us a proper answer, Mr. Minister. Don't take the House for granted.

SHRI SHIVRAJ PATIL: I should have a proper question to answer. If he wants to know whether the Air Traffic Controller is experienced or not, the answer is yes, he is experienced. Now, he has committed a mistake and we have taken action against him. This is a mistake committed by an individual who was sitting at the radar and the control system and we have taken action against him. It is not that he is a novice or that he is inexperienced or something like that.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Was an inquiry conducted? Let us be serious, Mr. Patil. I do not want to know anything else. I only want to know whether the matter is serious enough to engage your attention. Please take the House into confidence.

SHRI SHIVRAJ PATIL: Sir, I can answer questions. I cannot answer sound and fury. I have already said that the inquiry.. (*Interruptions*). Well, I am answering the questions. I cannot answer in the fashion you want me to answer. I have already said that the inquiry is conducted. We have taken action against him. The final inquiry to take penal action against him is going on again. Now we have suspended his licence. We have thrown him out of the actual service. We have taken cognizance of it. Moreover, I thought that you would like to know what mechanical means are being used to avoid such incidents in future. The answer is that the modernisation of Bombay and Delhi airports, Madras and Calcutta airorts and other airports is going on. A lot of money is required for that. About Rs. 300 crores is required for modernising of these two airports and Rs. 400 crores is required.... (*Interuptions*). I am answering the questions. I cannot answer your sound and fury.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: He talks of Rs. 900 crores. You have spent Rs. 2000 crores on buying A-320 Airbuses. You can spend Rs. 2000 crores to buy an aircraft but you cannot pay Rs. 100 crores to keep that aircraft safe.

MR. CHAIRMAN: This is a matter of opinion, please. Put your other supplementary now.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Let Mr. Sinha put his supplementary. My supplementaries do not get answers. He considers my questions as sound and fury.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Sinha.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Sir, the Minister has said in his reply that a plan for modernisation of the air traffic control system and installation of secondary surveillance radar at Bombay airport has been initiated. I would like to draw the attention of the Minister to the annual report of the Ministry which I have in my hand. It talks of navigational aids, etc. etc. and I find this does not mention anything about the secondary surveillance system and installation of radar at Bombay airport. The first part of my question is, therefore, whether this has been initiated as a result of this near-miss. Or, was it a part of the original plan of this Ministry? This is the first part of my question.

Now, I come to the second part. Again, Sir, I am sorry to bring back the Railways into it. Sir, there is a Commission for Railway Safety. But, surprisingly or perhaps correctly, this Commissioon, in order to be autonomous and independent, is under the control of the Ministry of Civil Aviation. Now, in view of the appalling safety record of the Indian Airlines, my question to the Minister is whether he would consider or the Government would consider setting up of an independent Airlines Safety Commission or something of that kind under the Railway Ministry or under any other Ministry so that they are independent and such an inquiry as the Minister has referred to in the House just now could be conducted by an independent inquiry commission which will recommend remedial measures which will be taken then by the Ministry of Tourism and Civil Aviation. These are my two questions.

SHRI SHIVRAJ PATIL: Sir, the questions are very well defined and I am in a position to answer these two questions, maybe to the satisfaction of the honourable Member.

Sir, the ask of modernising the Bombay and Delhi airports was taken

up long before this airmiss happened. Now, we are looking into the problem of modernising Bombay and Delhi airports, the two international airports, and we have been discussing the quality and the kind of equipment required for this purpose and whether this equipment can be had from within the country or whether it is to be imported from other places or can be manufactured here also. A huge amount of money is also involved in it and we shall have to find out as to from where this amount of money is going to come and we are at it and they are in a position to take a decision very soon. After the decision is taken, implementation would start and we would be putting up these things. Later on, we are going to have Madras and Calcutta airports also modernised for this purpose and the other airports also will be modernised. So, this is my answer to his first question.

As far as the second question is concerned, I find a lot of substance in it because the safety organization which is there under the Civil Aviation Ministry is looking into the accidents that are taking place on the Railways and it is a good idea to have an organization independent of the Civil Aviation Ministry so that independently it can have a look at these things. But I won't promise anything. National Transport Safety Board and other things are there. So, I won't promise any thing. But I can say that the idea is very good and we will certainly look into it and we will be happy to make use of it.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Sir, I am very happy that the Minister has accepted it as a good idea... *(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr. Sukomal Sen.

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN: Sir, whatever the Minister might have said, the airline passengers are fast losing confidence in the safety aspect of the Indian Airlines. This is a fact. Whenever they get into the aircraft, until they have a safe landing, they do not know what will happen to the aircraft and everybody feels insecure. Only recently, Sir, there was an air crash near Ahmedabad and then there was another one in Guwahati. Sometimes the doors opend suddenly and sometimes the under carriage does not open up and sometimes the electrical system fails. These things are happening frequently these days. Now, from the Minister's reply, I find that four airports are being modernised, that is, Calcutta, Bombay, Delhi and Madras. But a large number of other airports are also there. He says that they are also being modernised. Very feebly he is saying that they are also being modernised.

MR. CHAIRMAN: You please put your supplementary.

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN: Sir, I would like to know whether all these airports will be properly modernised so that the safety aspect is guaranteed. It is not only a question of modernising, but it is also a question of maintenance. Unless the equipment is properly maintained. How is the safety aspect of aircraft going to be maintained? It is not possible at all. Therefore, I would like to know what the Government's total plan or scheme for modernising all the airports in the country is and also for the proper maintenance and overhaul of the aircraft. Unless the periodic overhauling and maintenance are done, how can the safety be guaranteed? I would like to have a specific reply from the honourable Minister.

SHRI SHIVRAJ PATIL: Sir, I spoke about the international airports first because this question arose out of the airmiss at Bombay airport. These airports also have to be modernised and they have to be provided with the equipment which they require and a huge amount of money is required for this purpose. About Rs. 900 crores are required for the

modernisation of all other ports. And we are not giving any budgetary support. They have to earn and they have to depend on themselves. Thirdly, we are not depending only on the equipment that is existing today. But for the benefit of hon. Members, I would like to say that we have been informed that the Satellite Navigation Systems are also being developed internationally, and if possible we will like to make use of the Satellite Navigation Systems also. But it is something futuristic. Nothing definite can be said at this point of time. But we are not content with what we are doing today but we are looking at this problem from a long-term planning. We have a perspective plan and we are trying to implement that perspective plan. But within the given time it is not possible for me to give the information about all the airports and then convince the hon. Members. It is because of the constraints of time that we are not able to give you information on the floor of the House, but you can rest assured that we are trying to do our best. The first constraint is funds. We do not have enough funds. The second constraint is that the organisation was brought into existence only three years back and this organisation is working. We are trying to develop these things also.

MR. CHAIRMAN: About the question of overworking...

SHRI SHIVRAJ PATIL: That is also a very good question. For the information of the hon. Member I would like to say that we were flying our aircrafts for 3100 hours. Now we have reduced the flying hours from 3100 hours to 2850 hours. Now we have inducted new aircrafts also. Five Airbuses have already come and we have about 8 other aircrafts taken on lease. And that has given us a cushion. We are flying them a little less and we are providing equipment which can help us to maintain these aircrafts to a particular standard. You can rest assured that on that point also we are taking appropriate steps.

SHRI VISHWA BANDHU GUPTA: I appreciate the problems that the hon. Minister has with regard to the equipment in trying to modernise airports. Sir, I would like to know from the hon. Minister whether he has also taken into account the difficulties faced by the Air Controllers. Sir, he is going in for Air Taxis. This will certainly increase the risk and it will have a greater impact on the safety factors. Now, I would like to know whether the equipment and the training for the Air Controllers is to his satisfaction and whether he has taken care to see that they have no difficulties which have been brought to his notice more than once, I think. What steps are being taken in this regard?

SHRI SHIVRAJ PATIL: Again I was inclined to appreciate the question, but I will not do that. (*Interruptions*) I would like to say that we have taken into account the traffic jams because of air taxis also and we are trying to modernise our airports. We are trying to provide three-dimensional computers and all these things. And commensurately, we are trying to train people who are sitting there and controlling.

SHRI VISHWA BANDHU GUPTA: My question is whether the hon. Minister is satisfied that...

MR. CHAIRMAN: He has given you the reply.

PROF. C. LAKSHMANNA: The Minister knows that each airport is having 4 or 5 agencies. There is no co-ordination between one agency and other. As a result of this, we are having all these accidents. Recently we read in newspapers that one air hostess averted another aircrash because the bolts of the door were coming off. It was not checked. On the other hand, it is supposed that everytime the aircraft takes off, it should be given an air-worthiness certificate. It is happening because even in the international airports,

there is the problem of co-ordination. In fact, the previous Chairman of the International Airport Authority had complained to the Ministry that unless they entrust the staff to one of the agencies, it would be very difficult to co-ordinate their activities. In the first instance, I would like to know whether you have decided as to which will be the designated authority to co-ordinate the activities at the airports, more particularly the international airports. If so, what are the agencies to co-ordinate the activities of 3 or 4 agencies which are now operating at the airports, both national airports and international airports?

Part (b) of my question is this. He is talking about 900 crores of rupees. 900 crores of rupees have become a scarecrow. The amount of 900 crores of rupees is being mentioned on the floor of the House for the last two years.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please put your supplementary now.

PROF. C. LAKSHMANNA: In the meanwhile there have been several types of amounts raised for meeting the needs. Therefore, I would like to ask how is it that they have not been able to make a provision out of these 900 crores to meet the requirements of modernisation of the airports. Part (c) of my question is that even the equipment that has been procured...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please put your question.

PROF. C. LAKSHMANNA: I have not been aware of it for the last three months. Otherwise, the equipment that has been imported such as CAT II, etc. in Bombay airport has not been put to use. I would like to have a categorical reply from the hon. Minister whether all the equipment that has been imported for modernisation of the airports has been put to use. If it has not been put to use, what are the reasons therefor?

SHRI SHIVRAJ PATIL: The activity of civil aviation is too complicated and the hon. Member has to put so many questions into one question and given them to me. I find it very difficult to answer all his question without answering all the points. I would like to say that 900 crores of rupees is the amount of money required for modernisation of the airports for navigation and communication purposes. This amount is not given to us from the budget. We shall have to raise it ourselves and we have to pay it. Let it be understood by the hon. Member.

As far as co-ordination of the activities between all the organisations is concerned, we have asked our officers at the airports belonging to different organisations to have regular meetings. The senior-most officer will preside over the meetings. They will decide this thing. Now, the maintenance activity is such that it cannot be handled by those who fly. Those who maintain cannot fly. Those who have to maintain the airports are not in a position to fly. Those who fly cannot do the maintenance work. The activities are different. Therefore, co-ordination is necessary. The committee would co-ordinate.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Question No. 124.

Committee on Housing facilities for Women Teachers

*124. SHRI SHANTI TYAGI:†
DR. RATNAKAR PANDEY:

Will the Minister of HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT be pleased to state:

(a) whether the committee on housing facilities for women teachers set up by the Central Advisory Board of Education has recommended cluster houses in rural areas;

†The question was actually asked on the floor of the House by Shri Shanti Tyagi.